

**MINUTES
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
THURSDAY, DECEMBER 13, 2007, 9:00 A.M.**

Board Members Present at Roll Call: Les Abrams, Gabe Corral, Charlie Havranek, Cynthia Henry, Myra Jefferson, Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: Rod Bolden. Board Members Absent: None. Vacant Board Member Positions: Public; Certified Residential Appraiser.

Also Present at Roll Call: Debb Pearson, Executive Director; Beckie Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Dawn Walton-Lee, Assistant Attorney General; Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

Gabe Corral moved that the Minutes of the November 15, 2007, Regular Board Meeting be approved. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC

None.

PUBLIC HEARING ON RULEMAKING PACKAGE

R4-46-101, Definitions; R4-46-201, Appraiser Qualification Criteria

No public comments were received concerning the proposed rules. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board close the record, adopt the rule change as proposed:

ARTICLE 1. GENERAL PROVISIONS

R4-46-101. Definitions.

In these rules, unless the context otherwise requires:

"Arizona or State Certified General Appraiser" No change

"Arizona or State Certified Residential Appraiser" No change

"Arizona or State Licensed Appraiser" No change

"Appraisal Foundation" No change

"Appraiser" No change

"Board" No change

"Board counsel" No change

"Board staff" No change
"Complaint" No change
"Consent agreement" No change
"Consulting assignment" No change
"Conviction" No change
"Course provider" No change
"Direct supervision" means that a supervising appraiser is ~~physically present to direct and oversee~~
directing and overseeing the production of each appraisal assignment.
"Disciplinary action" No change
"Dismissal" No change
"Distance education" No change
"Due diligence" No change
"Formal complaint" No change
"Formal hearing" No change
"Informal hearing" No change
"Informational interview" No change
"Initial review" No change
"Investigation" No change
"Investigator" No change
"Jurisdictional criteria" No change
"Letter of concern" No change
"Letter of due diligence" No change
"Letter of remedial action" No change
"Mentor" No change
"Order" No change
"Party" No change
"Practicing appraiser" No change
"Probation" No change
"Property tax agent" No change
"Remedial action" No change
"Respondent" No change
"Rules" No change
"Summary suspension" No change
"Supervising appraiser" No change
"Trainee" No change
"USPAP" No change
"Workfile" No change

ARTICLE 2. LICENSING AND CERTIFICATION

R4-46-201. Appraiser Qualification Criteria

A. Except as provided in subsections (B), (C), and (D), an applicant for the applicable

classification of license or certificate shall meet that classification's criteria established by the Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) in either *The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria and Interpretations of the Criteria* adopted February 16, 1994 effective January 1, 1998, ~~All~~ all *Interpretations and Supplementary Information* as of January 1, 2002, and *Appendix I, Criteria Revisions* effective January 1, 2003, ("1998 Criteria"), or *The Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria* Adopted January 1, 2003, ~~All~~ all *Interpretations And Supplementary Information* as of ~~November 1, 2005, February 1, 2007,~~ and *Appendix, Real Property Qualifications* ~~Effective~~ effective January 1, 2008 ("2008 Criteria"), as follows:

1. The requirements are divided into three components: education, experience and examination. An applicant shall meet the criteria in effect at the time the applicant completes a particular component.
 2. The Board shall give credit for completion of a component if the applicant meets either the 1998 Criteria or the 2008 Criteria for any component completed prior to January 1, 2008.
 3. The Board shall give credit for completion of a component only if the applicant meets the 2008 Criteria for any component completed on or after January 1, 2008.
 4. On and after November 1, 2008, an applicant shall meet the 2008 Criteria for all components, regardless of when the component was completed. Both the 1998 Criteria and the 2008 Criteria are incorporated by reference and are on file with the Board. These incorporated criteria include no future additions or amendments. A copy of the incorporated criteria may be obtained from the Board or The Appraisal Foundation.
- B.** Regardless of whether a transaction is federally related:
1. A State Licensed Residential Appraiser is limited to the scope of practice in A.R.S. § 32-3612(A)(3), and
 2. A State Certified Residential Appraiser is limited to the scope of practice in A.R.S. § 32-3612(A)(2).
- C.** Notwithstanding the criteria incorporated by reference in subsection (A),
1. An applicant shall not obtain more than 75% of required qualifying education through distance education,
 2. An applicant shall not obtain the 15-hour National USPAP Course, or its equivalent, approved through the AQB Course Approval Program, through distance education, ~~and~~
 3. Qualifying education credit may be obtained at any time before the date of application, except the 15-hour National USPAP Course or its AQB approved equivalent must be obtained within two years preceding the date of application-, and
 4. 75% of the applicant's quantitative experience requirements must include work product where the applicant inspected the subject property. This subsection (C)(4) shall become effective May 1, 2008.
- D.** Notwithstanding the criteria incorporated by reference in subsection (A), there is no Trainee Real Property Appraiser Classification.
1. A supervising appraiser shall instruct and directly supervise a trainee for any classification of license or certificate in the entire preparation of each appraisal. The supervising appraiser shall approve and sign all final appraisal documents- certifying

the appraisals are in compliance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. A supervising appraiser and trainee must work in the same state and the supervising appraiser must personally and physically supervise the entire inspection of each appraised property with the trainee. To demonstrate responsibility for the instruction, guidance, and direct supervision of the trainee, the supervising appraiser shall:

- a. ~~Sign the appraisal report and certify the report is in compliance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice,~~
 - b. ~~Personally supervise the entire physical inspection of each appraised property with the trainee, and~~
 - c. ~~Review and sign each trainee appraisal report.~~
2. A trainee may have more than one supervising appraiser, but a supervising appraiser shall not supervise more than three trainees at any one time. A trainee shall maintain an appraisal log for each supervising appraiser and, at a minimum, include the following in the log for each appraisal:
- a. Type of property,
 - b. Date of report,
 - c. Property description,
 - d. Description of work performed by the trainee and scope of review and supervision by the supervising appraiser,
 - e. Number of actual work hours by the trainee on the assignment, and
 - f. The signature and state certificate number of the supervising appraiser.
- ~~This subsection (D)(2)(f) is effective January 1, 2008.~~
3. ~~A supervising appraiser and trainee shall work in the same geographic area, and in no event shall the supervising appraiser and trainee work in different states.~~
4. 3. A supervising appraiser shall provide to the Board in writing the name and address of each trainee within 10 days of engagement, and notify the Board in writing immediately upon termination of the engagement. A state certified appraiser is not eligible to be a supervising appraiser unless the appraiser's certificate is in good standing and the appraiser has not been subject to license or certificate suspension, probation, or mentorship within the last two years. ~~This subsection (D)(4) is effective January 1, 2008.~~
4. An appraiser who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser must submit proof of completion of a minimum of four hours of continuing education approved by the Board regarding the role of a supervising appraiser before such supervision begins. The required course shall not be taken through distance education.
5. All supervising appraisers shall submit to the Board proof of completion of a minimum of four hours of continuing education approved by the Board regarding the role of a supervising appraiser within 60 days of the effective date of this subsection (D)(5). The required course shall not be taken through distance education. If the supervising appraiser does not take the course within 60 days of the effective date of this subsection (D)(5), the supervising appraiser may no longer act as a supervising appraiser until the class is taken and proof has been submitted to the Board.

- 4.6. In the event that an appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) or a supervising appraiser does not comply with the requirements of this subsection (D):
- a. The appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) or the supervising appraiser will be subject to disciplinary action pursuant to A.R.S. § 32-3631(A)(8), and
 - b. The trainee shall not receive experience credit for all hours logged during the period that the supervising appraiser or appraiser (who wishes to act as a supervising appraiser) has failed to comply with the requirements of this subsection (D).

Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Informal Hearing Concerning 2224, Harrison Gordon/2225, Joshua Hernandez; Review and Action Concerning 2226, Nicolo Amoroso.

Respondent in 2224 did not appear. Respondents in 2225 and 2226, and Dan Hagen appeared in person, were sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Nan Poestchek appeared in telephonically, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations concerning 2224 and 2226, and that the complaints be dismissed. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table 2225 and that staff subpoena additional information. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board open a complaint against Nicolo Amoroso concerning his experience log. The motion was withdrawn.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2242, Gary S. Granville/2364, Tune P. Redmond.

Debbie Rudd recused herself. Respondents appeared, were sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Gabe Corral moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss 2364, and close 2242 based on the Board's prior finding of a Level I violation and prior nondisciplinary letter of concern. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2379, Michael S. Mason.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing the violations and requiring probation and disciplinary education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2501, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that staff subpoena additional information. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2380, Timothy J. Morris.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level II violations and issue Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

RECOGNITION AND RECEPTION FOR RETIRED BOARD MEMBER, SARAH C. VETAULT

Sarah C. Vetault, retired Board member, appeared and was presented a plaque thanking her for serving on the Board on behalf of both the Board and the State of Arizona.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2500, Jill A. Trompeter.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2480, Lisa S. Speelman.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and requiring remedial education. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board issue a cease and desist letter to Respondent regarding her acting as a supervising appraiser. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2486, Kisten L. Stormo.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2492, Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Gabe Corral moved that the Board refer the matter to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA), Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Dawn Walton-Lee updated the Board with the status of Respondent=s appeal.

Rod Bolden joined the meeting.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2384, Peter B. Repsold.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing the violations and restricting Respondent's scope of practice. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2403, Safa P. Sitto.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Paul Richter, Esq., represented Respondent. Gabe Corral moved that the Board find that the subject appraisal was performed within the same time period as the subject appraisal in 2278, which is the subject of Respondent's current probation; and that the complaint be closed. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted 6-1 in favor of the motion. Cynthia Henry voted no.

Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, joined the meeting.

Issue Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 2321 (07F-2321-BOA), Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Dawn Walton Lee, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board reject the Findings of Fact on the grounds of inaccuracy in the record and remand the matter back to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) for a new formal hearing. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Issue Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning CG Application 6829, Scott A. McCorvie.

Respondent did not appear. Dawn Walton Lee, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board rescind its referral to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find certified general appraiser application 6829, Scott A. McCorvie, substantively complete. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, left the meeting.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2415, Ambrose Rojas.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2418, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level IV violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing the violations and providing for suspension, probation, mentorship and disciplinary education. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2496, John R. Fournier.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2497, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2197, John A. Bellerose.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board terminate Respondent's mentorship and probation. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Cynthia Henry left the meeting. A quorum remained.

Review and Action Concerning 2498, Jennifer K. Cucci.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board dismiss the complaint for lack of jurisdiction. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Cynthia Henry rejoined the meeting.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2431, Gerald A. Diehl.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Brian Flaherty, Esq., represented Respondent. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing violations and requiring probation, mentorship and disciplinary education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2473, Brooke Patterson.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board=s questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing violations and requiring disciplinary education. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-2 in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek and Les Abrams voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2499, Leonid Zavlunov.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2502, Clare A. Williamson-Redding.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2503, Randall P. Jacobs.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that staff subpoena additional information. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2215, John K. Senerchia.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral moved that the Board terminate the mentorship and probation. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2240, Anna M. Diaz.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board approve David A. Lewin, Certified General Appraiser #30380, as Respondent's mentor. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2244, Laura J. Kokot.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board open complaint 2539 against Respondent alleging noncompliance with the 6/1/07 due diligence consent letter. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2420/2482, Jill A. Trompeter.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigative report for 2420. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing for 2420. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table 2482 pending Respondent's renewal of her license. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2488, Richard A. Webb.

Respondent did not appear. Complainant appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Gabe Corral moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for a continuance. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Les Abrams moved that the Board table the matter to allow the Assistant Attorney General to follow-up in the matter. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2421, Michelle T. Caraballo.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for correction of typographical errors. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2477, Robert L. VanDyke.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for correction of typographical errors. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2224, Harrison Gordon/2225, Joshua Hernandez/2226, Nicolo Amoroso.

Respondents did not appear. In its 12-month file review, the Board noted that the complaints had been handled earlier in the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2242, Gary S. Granville.

Debbie Rudd recused herself. Respondent did not appear. In its 12-month file review, the Board noted that the complaint had been handled earlier in the meeting.

BOARD CHAIRPERSON REPORT

None.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Debb Pearson reported on the status of the Assistant Attorney General=s assignments; advised no complaint answer dates had been extended by staff; reported the following complaint statistics as of 11/30/07 for calendar years 2006 and 2007:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2007</u>
Complaints filed	209	226	
Complaints heard by Board			584
<u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u>			
Complaints dismissed	70	74	91
Complaints referred to investigation	84	71	112
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	30	13	19
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	11	10	16
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	6	6	8
Complaints resolved with probation	30	15	41
Complaints referred to informal hearing	67	35	78
Complaints referred to formal hearing	32	4	31
Complaints resolved with suspension	6	2	3
Complaints resolved with surrender	2	1	2
Complaints resolved with revocation	1	3	4
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	24	1	3
Violation Levels:			
I	35	17	24
II	11	14	20
III	22	13	37
IV	3	3	5
V	10	3	5

Additional Information:

	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	21	20	9
Denials of New Applications	5	7	7
Denials of Renewal Applications	2	4	1

reported on the status of the Board's three pending rulemaking packages; and updated the Board concerning the 2008 national examination.

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of December 10, 2007:

	<u>12/05</u>	<u>12/06</u>	<u>12/07</u>
Licensed Residential	919	1078	1103
Certified Residential	842	959	1097
Certified General	762	768	796
Nonresident Temporary	81	56	27
Property Tax Agents	288	302	269
	<i>Total 2604</i>	<i>Total 2861</i>	<i>Total 3023</i>

Myra Jefferson moved that the Board approve the revised application forms. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find licensed residential renewal application #10453, Joshua Hernandez, substantively complete. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted 4-3 in favor of the motion. Cynthia Henry, Myra Jefferson and Debbie Rudd voted no. Myra Jefferson moved that the Board

accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT

Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

OLD BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning *United States of America v. Frank Padilla, Carlos ("Charlie") Bent*, Tucson District Court Case No. CR 06-1430-TUC-RCC (BPV), \$13 Million Mortgage Fraud Conspiracy.

Les Abrams moved that the Board open complaints against the subject appraisers. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Regarding Broker's Price Opinions.

The Board took no action for lack of jurisdiction.

Discussion and Action Regarding Indemnification of Contract Investigators.

Staff was instructed to inform the contract investigators that, based on procurement and risk management policies, there would be no indemnification by the Board.

Discussion and Action Regarding Craigslist Posting.

The Board took no action.

CONFIRMATION OF MEETING DATES, TIMES, LOCATIONS AND PURPOSES

The upcoming Committee and Board meetings were scheduled as follows:

January

16	Application Review Committee	9:00 a.m.
17	Appraisal Testing and Education Committee	7:15 a.m.
17	Budget Committee	8:40 a.m.
17	Board	9:00 a.m.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned.

Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

TO: Board of Appraisal

From: Application Review Committee

Date: December 13, 2007

Re: December 12, 2007 Recommendations

I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:

	<u>12/05</u>		<u>12/06</u>		<u>12/07</u>
Licensed Residential	919		1078		1103
Certified Residential	842		959		1097
Certified General	762		768		796
Nonresident Temporary	81	Total 2604	56	Total 2861	27
Property Tax Agents	288		302		269

II. As a result of its December 12, 2007 meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:

- A.** To refer approval of applications to meet the 1/1/08 Criteria to the full Board.
- B.** Instructions completed concerning acceptance of residential experience from applicants.
- C.** To refer the following renewal application to the full Board:

10453 Joshua Hernandez
- D.** To take no action on application:

6904 Patience S. Crayton
- E.** To approve the following applications as substantively complete:
 - 1.** Renewal applications:

21081 Paul A. Botts
21252 Brayden C. Critchlow

2. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

6617	Brent A. Hodges
6883	Steve J. Gaul
7036	Jared S. Rail
7019	Jason T. Grec (by reciprocity)
7094	James J. Dowd
7098	Heather D. Smith
7102	Jonathan F. Williams
7153	Angela M. Mortenson
7162	Brian S. Talbert
7169	Kelly J. Schmidt
7174	Sandra L. Campbell

3. Certified Residential by exam unless otherwise noted:

6595	Rachel I. Encinas
6940	Morris E. Harvey
6947	Janet L. Carpini
6951	Joann D. Hilberger
6986	Kevin D. Caswell
6993	Chris T. Currence
6997	Allan E. Pike
7014	Chrystine A. Meadows
7021	Frank T. Henshaw
7023	Christopher B. Benes
7025	John F. Peck III
7035	James R. Shea
7037	John S. Peterson
7039	Daniel D. Schmelz
7040	King G. Ruby
7042	Curtis L. Ashcroft
7047	Timothy A. Barber
7052	Sandra H. Carden
7054	Brad D. Mazerolle
7059	Denise Valverde
7066	Greg R. Gunn
7067	Christine A. Farrar
7068	Washington M. Mason, Jr.
7083	Brad L. Duecker
7105	Jason A. Lusk
7106	Thomas B. Sheehy
7108	David M. Snyder
7110	Lynda M. Isdahl
7111	Phillip W. Empey

7114	William A. Turpin
7115	Cathy L. King
7116	Michele R. Cruz
7117	Jeffrey J. Clifford
7121	Joyce K. Lara
7127	Chasin D. Jenkins
7133	Jerri A. Regan
7134	Geoffrey D. Sweeney
7135	Al H. Schutza
7142	Kenneth A. Softley
7161	Jessica D. Pena (Debbie Rudd recused herself)
7166	William B. Smith
7167	Alexander A. Tapia
7175	Gregory K. Defoor

4. Certified General by exam unless otherwise noted:

6630	Jesse B. Tougas
7038	Petra C. Della Valle (by reciprocity)
7113	Susanne Grace-Poore

F. To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:

1. Reciprocity

21654	Randy N. Deines
21662	Susan A. Lorrain
31581	John A. Fowler
31583	Douglas S. Defoor
31584	Steven D. Henry
31585	James Q. Gipson
31586	Marla L. Britton

2. Nonresident Temporary

TP41074	Karen L. Blosser
TP41075	Carl Parker

G. To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:

7022	Robert J. Sitter
7062	Richard A. Norfolk
7078	Lisa F. MacDonald

7085	Janet A. Defrancesco
7086	Timothy L. Scheible
7088	Eric C. Pfeiffer (by reciprocity)
7090	Raymod R. Bluth
7091	Brandon L. Hawks (by reciprocity)
7100	Steven P. Hanna
7124	Mark L. Kelly
7139	Anne L. Bird
7140	Pamela M. Harris
7141	Chad E. Haggard
7148	Jarold T. Droegkamp
7151	Glenda R. Lawson
7156	Debra T. Miller
7198	Marla H. Tannenbaum (by reciprocity)

III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete

6489	Jose Magana
6562	Barbara J. Hallbourg
6841	Larry R. Hamby
6906	Teresa J. Wagner
6939	Ryan W. Melzer
6953	Daniel J. Kennedy (by reciprocity)
6996	Richard D. Ellis
6998	Stephen Rich (by reciprocity)
7017	Michael J. Heaton
7027	Thomas E. Chambers

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

RECOMMENDATIONS

COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION

TO: Board of Appraisal

FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education

DATE: December 13, 2007

RE: December 13, 2007 Recommendations

As a result of its December 13, 2007 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:

I. Action regarding proposed approval of **qualifying education courses:**

A. Previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Advanced Income Capitalization**, #ABA 1101-078 40 hours
*Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
 - b. **530 Advanced Sales Comparison & Cost Approach**, #ABA 1101-080 40 hours
*Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - c. **550 Advanced Applications**, #ABA 1101-081 40 hours
*Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - d. **330 Apartment Appraisal: Concepts and Applications**, #ABA 0402-208
16 hours
*Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
 - e. **General Appraiser Income Approach-Part 1**, #ABA 1206-594 30 hours
*Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - f. **General Appraiser Income Approach-Part 2**, #ABA 1206-595 30 hours
*Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval

2. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **AP-03 2008-2009 National USPAP**, #ABA 0502-214-3 15 hours
*Daniel Smith, Roy Morris III
Recommend approval
 3. Submitted by Career Web School
 - a. **Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach**, #ABA D1106-589 Distance Education 15 hours
*A.M. Black
Recommend approval
 - b. **Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use Description**, #ABA D1106-590 Distance Education 15 hours
*A.M. Black
Recommend approval
- II. Action regarding proposed approval of **continuing education courses**:
- A. Previously approved by the Board:**
1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **540 Report Writing & Valuation Analysis**, #ABA 0402-184 40 hours
*Alan Blankenship
Recommend approval
 - b. **Residential Demonstration Appraisal Report Writing Seminar**, #ABA 1102-256 7 hours
*Sandra Adomatis
Recommend approval
 - c. **Subdivision Valuation: A Comprehensive Guide to Valuing Improved Subdivisions**, #ABA 1204-385 7 hours
*Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
 - d. **Office Building Valuation: A Contemporary Perspective**, #ABA 1206-597 7 hours
*Barrett Slade
Recommend approval
 2. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **C5908 2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, #ABA 0103-262 7 hours
*Daniel Smith, Roy Morris III
Recommend approval
 3. Submitted by Career Web School
 - a. **Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach**, #ABA D1106-591 Distance Education 14 hours
*A.M. Black
Recommend approval

- b. **Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use Description**, #ABA D1106-592 Distance Education 14 hours
*A.M. Black
Recommend approval
 - 4. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **Practical Issues In Fair Housing**, #ABA 1205-495 3 hours
*Leonard Elder
Recommend approval
 - b. **Land 101 Program**, #ABA 1206-599 7 hours
*Robert Benedon
Recommend approval
- B. Not previously approved by the Board:**
- 1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **An Introduction to Valuing Green Buildings**, 7 hours
*Theddi Chappell
Recommend approval
 - b. **Online GIS - The Building Case Study**, 21 hours
*Christopher Miner
Recommend approval
 - 2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute/Southern Arizona Chapter
 - a. **Water 2007: Regulating the Resource- An Overview of Water & Water Utility Issues of Commercial Real Estate Professional**, 3 hours
*Kathleen Chavez, Kenneth Seasholes, Michael McNulty
Recommend approval
 - 3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **R.E. Foreclosures-Legal & Practical Concerns**, 3 hours
*Earl Berg, Michael Denious, Diane Drain, Bill Gray, Den Klobberdanz, William Kozub, James Miller, Don Miner, Becky Ryan
Recommend approval
 - 4. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
 - a. **Income Approach: An Overview**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*James Hogan
Recommend approval
 - b. **Mortgage Fraud: A Dangerous Business**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*James Hogan
Recommend approval
 - c. **Residential Cost Approach**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*James Hogan
Recommend approval

- d. **Sales Comparison Approach**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*James Hogan
Recommend approval
- 5. Submitted by Mckissock, LP
 - a. **Even Odder: More Oddball Appraisals**, 7 hours
*Tracy Martin, Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - b. **Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony**, 7 hours
*Tracy Martin, Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - c. **Mortgage Fraud: Protect Yourself!**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*Dan Bradley
Recommend approval
 - d. **The Evolution of Finance and the Mortgage Market**, 4 hours
Distance Education
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
- 6. Submitted by Trans-American Institute of Professional Studies, Inc.
 - a. **Residential Report Writing Skills**, 7 hours
*Lynne Heiden, Ann Susko
Recommend approval

III. Action regarding proposed approval of instructor approval:

- 1. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **Frank Bell**
 - (1) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
 - (2) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
 - (3) AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12
 - (4) AP-104A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14
 - (5) AP-104B General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0707-674-14Recommend approval
 - b. **Earland Cass**
 - (1) AP-01 Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA 0906-569-1
 - (2) AP-02 Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA 0906-570-2
 - (3) AP-04 Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0607-650-4
 - (4) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
 - (5) AP-06 Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches, #ABA 0607-652-6
 - (6) AP-07 Residential Report Writing, #ABA 0906-571-7

- (7) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
- (8) AP-09 Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, #ABA 0707-673-9
- (9) AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0907-688-11
- (10) AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12
- (11) AP-104A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14
- (12) AP-104B General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0707-674-14

Recommend approval

c. **Neil Dauler-Phinney**

- (1) AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12
- (2) AP-13 General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach, #ABA 0907-690-13
- (3) AP-104A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14
- (4) AP-104B General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0707-674-14

Recommend approval

d. **Matthew Hassett**

- (1) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
- (2) AP-06 Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches, #ABA 0607-652-6
- (3) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
- (4) AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12
- (5) AP-104A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14
- (6) AP-104B General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0707-674-14

Recommend approval

e. **Robert Kaczmarek**

- (1) AP-01 Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA 0906-569-1
- (2) AP-02 Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA 0906-570-2
- (3) AP-04 Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0607-650-4
- (4) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
- (5) AP-06 Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches, #ABA 0607-652-6
- (6) AP-07 Residential Report Writing, #ABA 0906-571-7
- (7) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
- (8) AP-09 Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, #ABA 0707-673-9
- (9) AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0907-688-11

f. **James Miller**

- (1) AP-01 Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA 0906-569-1
- (2) AP-02 Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA 0906-570-2
- (3) AP-04 Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0607-650-4

- (4) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
 - (5) AP-06 Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches, #ABA 0607-652-6
 - (6) AP-07 Residential Report Writing, #ABA 0906-571-7
 - (7) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
 - (8) AP-09 Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, #ABA 0707-673-9
 - (9) AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0907-688-11
 - (10) AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12
 - (11) AP-13 General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach, #ABA 0907-690-13
 - (12) AP-104A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14
 - (13) AP-104B General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0707-674-14
- Recommend approval

g. **Nina Tross**

- (1) 2805 Business Structures or Business Ownership, #ABA 0901-029
- Recommend approval

h. **Richard Turkian**

- (1) AP-01 Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA 0906-569-1
- (2) AP-02 Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA 0906-570-2
- (3) AP-04 Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0607-650-4
- (4) AP-05 Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0607-651-5
- (5) AP-06 Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches, #ABA 0607-652-6
- (6) AP-07 Residential Report Writing, #ABA 0906-571-7
- (7) AP-08 Statistics, Modeling, Finance, ABA #0707-672-8
- (8) AP-09 Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, #ABA 0707-673-9
- (9) AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0907-688-11
- (10) Appraisal 103- General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0407-621-11

Recommend approval

IV. Action regarding proposed approval of continuing education credit:

1. Submitted by Westford College

a. Lyle Lavine

- (1) 90-Hour Qualifying Course (not including National USPAP), #ABA 0202-148
75 hours

Recommend approval